

# LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a Briefing/Public Hearing at 1:01 p.m. June 6, 2022 online with WebEx.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

Diane Sherman – Dist. 1 Evelyn Montgomery – Vice Chair – Dist. 2 Robert Swann – Dist. 4 Larry Offutt – Dist. 5 Jim Anderson – Alternate Jeff Cummings - Alternate Reagan Rothenberger – Dist. 12 Elaine Velvin – Dist. 15

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: No one

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:

Rosemary Hinojosa, Dist. 6 Traswell Livingston, III – Dist. 7 Courtney Spellicy – Dist. 8 Louis Renaud – Dist. 9 Katy Slade – Dist. 13

Mark Guest – Dist. 14

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:

Rosemary Hinojosa, Dist. 6

Traswell Livingston, III - Dist. 7

Courtney Spellicy - Dist. 8

Louis Renaud - Dist. 9

Katy Slade – Dist. 13

Mark Guest - Dist. 14

CPC, Liaison Joanna Hampton

# Landmark Commission Minutes Monday, June 6, 2022

Districts 3 and 11		
-		
The following Staff was present:		
Scott Bellen Elaine Hill Adrian McClendon Murray Miller	Bertram Vandenberg Carlos van Onna Laura Groves van Onna	
Staff briefed the Landmark Commission o each briefing.	n each agenda item and a questi	ion-and-answer period followed
A variety of dockets, requests and briefir hearing. The applicants or their represheard, and using information and staff rethe following actions.	entatives presented their argur	ments, citizen comments were

# **Public Testimony:**

No speakers

Approval of Minutes – May 2, 2022

Motion was made to approve Consent items C1, C2, C5 – C9, C11, C13 and C14 following Staff Recommendations.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	0/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Motion was made to re-arrange the agenda and hear items D16, C3, C4, C10, C12, D7, D9 – D11, D15 and the remaining to be heard in their natural order.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# **CONSENT ITEMS**

# 1. 1300 S ERVAY ST

Ambassador Hotel CA212-013(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate for Demolition and Removal of structure due to destruction by fire be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(2)(B)(iii).

# 2. 3120 N HASKELL AVE

North Dallas High School CA212-357(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to redesign front yard lawn of school and construct plaza be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.2, 3.3, and 3.6 for building site and landscaping; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

# 3. 919 MORRELL AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Zion Hill Missionary Baptist Church CA212-356(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace and restore windows.

Speakers: For: William Baker

Against: No Speakers

# Motion #1 Deny without prejudice to give more time to determine the ordinance language.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	3/5				MOTION FAILED
		Ayes:	-	3	Anderson, Cummings, Offutt,
		Against:	-	5	Sherman, Montgomery, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### Motion #2

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace and restore windows be approved with the condition to maintain and display as much of the art glass as much as practical and in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.1 for facades and 5.1, 5.2, 5.3, and 5.6 for fenestration and openings; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# 4. 3750 COTTON BOWL PLZ (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Fair Park Historic District CA212-364(CVO) Carlos van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness to install high power speaker arrays and communication controls on top ring of Cotton Bowl Stadium.

Speakers: For: Jason Hayes

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

That the Certificate of Appropriateness to install high power speaker arrays and communication controls on the top ring of the Cotton Bowl Stadium be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22 **with the following condition**: that existing mounting points are used where possible to minimize visual impact. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.3(b) for the Cotton Bowl; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 5. 4310 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA212-359(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new ramp be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.1, 4.2 and 4.7 for new construction and additions; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new fencing be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 2.9, 2.10, 2.11, 2.13, 2.14, and 2.15 for site and site elements; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new signage and associated landscape be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 2.6 for site and site elements and 7.3 for signs; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior trim and accent features be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.7 for structure facades; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

## 6. 1008 GRIGSBY AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA212-358(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing shed structure be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, and 4.7 for new construction and additions; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

#### 7. 2621 SOUTH BLVD

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District

CD212-011(MGM)

Murray G. Miller

That the request for a Certificate for Demolition/Removal of existing accessory structure be **approved**, with the finding that the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Sections 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D)(ii) and (iii).

#### 8. 2621 SOUTH BLVD

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District

CA212-363(MGM)

Murray G. Miller

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new accessory structure in rear yard be **approved**, with the finding that the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

#### 9. 5908 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA212-350(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change roofing material on accessory structure from wood to asphalt shingles be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 51P-63.116(1)(A), (H), and (N) for accessory buildings, color, and roof forms; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

# 10. 5916 SWISS AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA212-351(MGM)

Murray Miller

Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct accessory structure.

Speakers: For: Noori Abdul-Ghani

Against: No Speakers

**Motion** 

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct accessory structure be **approved**, with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with Dallas Development Code: No. 19455, Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i)(bb) and is generally consistent with Sections 14(a)(1)(B), 14(a)(3), and 14(a)(14) of the Swiss Avenue Historic District Preservation Criteria.

Maker:	Offutt				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 11. 5916 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA212-352(MGM) Murray G. Miller

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to extend mudroom on main structure be **approved**, with the finding that the proposed work is consistent with the standards set out in Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i)(aa) of the Dallas Development Code and Section 14(a)(2) of the Swiss Avenue Historic District Preservation Criteria.

# 12. 6010 SWISS AVE (MOVED TO DISCUSSION)

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA212-353(MGM) Murray G. Miller

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct new accessory structure.

Speakers: For: David Benners

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct new accessory structure be **approved** with the finding that the proposed work meets the standards for approval set out in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i), with the finding that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the architectural features of the structure nor will it have an adverse effect on the historic overlay district.

Maker:	Montgomery		
Second:	Rothenberger		

Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# 13. 129 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-337(SB)

Scott Bellen

- That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace river stone gravel driveway with grey Tejas gravel driveway be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 06/06/22. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9) for sidewalks, driveways, and curbing and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install white Austin stone landscaping bed edging on driveway border be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 06/06/22. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b) 6 and 7 for landscaping materials and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

#### 14. 407 S MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-342(SB)

Scott Bellen

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint primary residence with Sherwin Williams, Body "Pewter Tankard" SW0023, Trim "Library Pewter" SW0038, and Accent "Roycroft Bronze Green" SW 2846 be **approved** per specifications dated 06/06/22. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a) 3 and 8; consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove non-original shutters be **approved**. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a) 3 and 17 related to architectural detail and shutters; consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

# **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### 1. 6008 JUNIUS ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA212-368(CVO)

#### Carlos van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace secondary front door with fiber-cement siding.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace secondary front door with fiber-cement siding be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1 for Protected facades and Section 5.1 for Historic doors and windows; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Rothenberger				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

## 2. 5935 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA212-369(CVO) Carlos van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a pergola in rear yard.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a pergola in the rear yard be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 6.2 for Roofs, Section 8.3(d) for style, and Section 8.5 for compatibility with the existing historic structure; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Rothenberger		
Second:	Sherman		
Results:	8/0		

Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
Against:	-	0	
Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

## 3. 4512 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA212-360(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install new signage.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install landscape lighting along main walkway.
- 3. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install security lighting.
- 4. A Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior brick.
- 5. A Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior trim and accent features.
- 6. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace roofing material.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new signage be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet Sections 2.1, 3.1, and 7.3 of the Peak's Suburban Addition preservation criteria; the standards in City Code Sections 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) and 51A-7.403(b); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install landscape lighting along main walkway be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.5 for site and site elements; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install security lighting be denied without prejudice, recommending the applicant see alternative lighting and camera options that are more appropriate to the historic District. The proposed work does not meet Sections 2.5 and 3.1 of the Peak's Suburban Addition preservation criteria; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior brick be **denied**. Primer must be removed by a contractor experienced in removal of paint from brick of historic structures. The proposed work does not meet Sections 2.2, 3.1, 3.4, and 3.7 of the Peak's Suburban Addition preservation criteria; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 5. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint exterior trim and accent features be **denied without prejudice**, but, the black paint is **denied**. The proposed work does not meet Sections 2.2, 3.1, 3.4, and 3.7 of the Peak's Suburban Addition preservation criteria; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

6. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace roofing material be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22 **with the condition** that the color of the roofing material will be Cobblestone Gray to most closely match the existing roofing material. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3.16 and 3.17 for structure – roofs; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	7/0				
		Ayes:	-	7	Anderson, Cummings, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	7	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

Commissioner Montgomery did not hear or vote on this item.

#### 4. 2423 SOUTH BLVD

South Blvd/Park Row Historic District CA212-361(CVO)
Carlos van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 19.2 kW roof-mounted solar system.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 19.2 kW roof-mounted solar system be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3(b) for compliance with the existing architectural patterns within the subdistrict; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation 2 and 9.

Maker:	Rothenberger				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade,

				Spellicy
	Vacancies:	ı	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 5. 6219 LA VISTA DR

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA212-354(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness retain replacement of original leaded glass windows with single-light glass.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain replacement of original leaded glass windows with single-light glass be **denied**. The proposed work does not meet Section 51P-63.116(1)(P) of the Swiss Avenue preservation criteria; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Rothenberger				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 6. 4905 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA212-349(LVO)

Laura Groves van Onna

A Certificate of Appropriateness to change roofing material on main structure from slate to asphalt shingles.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change roofing material on main structure from slate to asphalt shingles be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet Section

51P-63.116(1)(N) of the Swiss Avenue preservation criteria; the contributing standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 7. 338 S FLEMING AVE

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District CA212-367(MGM)
Murray G. Miller

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a single-story primary structure.

Speakers: For: Paul Wieneskie

Rand Shear

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new residence be **approved** subject to **the conditions** set out in the staff report, with the additional conditions:

- 1) water shedding and drainage be achieved without the use of gutters, which are not compatible with the historic district
- 2) that the foundation skirt be flared and sided with 117 siding or plain boards of a nominal dimension between 1" x 10" and 1" x 12" laid horizontally,
- that the detailing decisions be made consistent with the simple Victorian era detailing of the eaves and soffits,
- 4) that in the landscape plan, the basswood, Italian stone pine, abelia and Panicum 'Prairie Flame' grass be replaced with appropriate native selections and
- 5) that no Bermuda grass be added to what is already present, and
- 6) that sunny areas be planted in buffalo grass (Bouteloua dactyloides) and/or blue grama (Bouteloua gracilis) and

7) that shady areas be Calyptocarpus vialis, otherwise known as straggler daisy, Carex planostachys, otherwise known as cedar sedge, both very successful semi-shade tolerant plants native to the Tenth Street neighborhood.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	7/1				
		Ayes:	-	7	Anderson, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	1	Cummings
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 8. 3627 MEYERS ST

Wheatley Place Historic District CA212-366(CVO)

Carlos can Onna

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace roof shingles.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to repaint exterior white with black trim (Body: Glidden PPG1001-1 "Delicate White"; Trim: Behr 4300 "Flat Black").
- 3. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all siding with engineered wood.
- 4. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 8 windows.
- 5. A Certificate of Appropriateness to add wood screening to front porch.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

## Motion

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace roof shingles be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/6/22. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 6 for Roofs; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repaint exterior white with black trim (Body: Glidden PPG1001-1 "Delicate White"; Trim: Behr 4300 "Flat Black") be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.8 for Paint colors; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all siding with engineered wood be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4 for Facades; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- 4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace eight (8) windows with vinyl windows be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 5.3 for replacement windows; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 5. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add wood screening to front porch be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 7 for Porches; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i); and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Offutt				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 9. 403 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-340(SB)

Scott Bellen

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to retain replacement of metal windows with vinyl frame windows on primary residence.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the removal of storm doors.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain replacement of metal windows with vinyl frame windows on primary residence be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3) relating to architectural details and Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) relating to windows and doors; inconsistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for non-contributing structures; and inconsistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain the removal of storm doors be **approved**. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(C) relating to storm doors and consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for non-contributing structures.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

## 10. 116 S ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-299(MGM) Murray G. Miller

1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new two-story structure.

2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install a wood fence.

Speakers: For: Eddie Fortuna

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion #1

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new two-story structure be **approved subject to conditions** set out in the staff report with the finding that the implementation of the conditions would enable the work to be consistent with Sections 51P-87.111(a)(1) of the Winnetka Heights Historic District Ordinance, the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i)(bb), and the recommended preservation guidance related to Settings within districts/neighborhoods as set out in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a wood fence be **approved** with the finding that the proposed is consistent with Sections 51P-87.111(b)(2)(A), (B), (C((ii), (D), and (G) of the Winnetka Heights Historic District Ordinance.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	3/5				MOTION FAILED
		Ayes:	-	3	Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman
		Against:	-	5	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Swann, Velvin
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy

		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11
--	--	------------	---	---	--------------------

#### Motion #2

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new two-story structure be **denied without prejudice** to give the applicant time to submit further details.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a wood fence be **denied without prejudice** to give the applicant time to submit further details.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Anderson				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 11. 200 N ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-338(SB)

Scott Bellen

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a 6 ft wood fence with 6 ft cedar fence in the same location.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to retain Oakridge Black composite shingle roof on primary structure.

Speakers: For: Sylvia Lagos

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion #1

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing 6 ft wood fence with 6 ft cedar fence in the same location be **approved** in accordance with the specifications dated 06/06/2022 **with the condition** that the fence does not screen all or any portion of a significant architectural feature of a main building on the same or an adjacent lot with the finding that the proposed work will therefore be consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(b)(2)(A), (B), (C)(ii), (D), and (G) for fences and the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain Oakridge Onyx Black composite shingle roof on primary structure be **denied** with the finding that the wood shingles were original and that the colors be weathered wood. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(3), (8)(E), and (14)(B) and is consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	6/2				
		Ayes:	-	6	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	2	Offutt, Rothenberger,
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### Motion #2

A motion was made to reconsider the motion.

Maker:	Anderson				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	7/1				
		_			
		Ayes:	-	7	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Sherman, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	1	Offutt
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### Motion #3

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing 6 ft wood fence with 6 ft cedar fence in the same location be **approved** in accordance with the specifications dated 06/06/2022 with the condition that the fence does not screen all or any portion of a significant architectural feature of a main building on the same or an adjacent lot with the finding that the proposed work will therefore be consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(b)(2)(A), (B), (C)(ii), (D), and (G) for fences and the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain Oakridge Onyx Black composite shingle roof on primary structure be **approved**. The proposed work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(3), (8)(E), and (14)(B) and is consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Anderson		
Second:	Swann		

Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# 12. 310 S ROSEMONT AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-339(SB) Scott Bellen

A Certificate of Appropriateness to paint primary residence with Sherwin Williams "Extra White" (SW7006) for body and trim and "Black Emerald" (SW2736) for the accent color only on the window sashes.

Speakers: For: Sylvia Lagos

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint primary residence with Sherwin Williams "Extra White" (SW7006) for body and trim and "Black Emerald" (SW2736) for the accent color only on the window sashes be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work is inconsistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(3); inconsistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and inconsistent with the recommended preservation guidance related to Settings within districts/neighborhoods as set out in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 13. 415 N WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-341(SB) Scott Bellen A Certificate of Appropriateness to Install 16 solar panels on roof.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install 16 solar panels on roof be **denied without prejudice.** The proposed work is inconsistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(14)(E)(i)(aa); inconsistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and inconsistent with the recommended preservation guidance related to Settings within districts/neighborhoods as set out in the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

#### 14. 119 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA212-336(SB) Scott Bellen

A Certificate of Appropriateness to retain Timberline HDZ roof shingles in "Charcoal" color.

Speakers: For: No Speakers

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to retain Timberline HDZ roof shingles in "Charcoal" color be **approved** with the finding that the work is consistent with the Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(a)(8)(E) and (14)(B) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures.

Maker:	Swann		
Second:	Offutt		

Results:	5/3				
		Ayes:	-	5	Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	3	Anderson, Cummings, Sherman
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# 15. 610 W JEFFERSON BLVD

Laura Groves van Onna

Hold a public hearing to consider initiation of historic designation process for 610 W Jefferson Blvd.

Speakers: For: David Preziosi

Against: No Speakers

#### **Motion**

Approved to consider for Initiation of Landmark status.

Maker:	Hinojosa				
Second:	Cummings				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# **16. 3111 N WINNETKA AVE**

Laura Groves van Onna

Hold a public hearing to consider initiation of historic designation process for 3111 N Winnetka Ave.

Speakers: For: David Preziosi

Against: Jonathan Whalen

Ana Alonso (Translator)

Cassandra Barron

Maria Barron Alicia Reyes Socorro Miranda Laura Zamora

Natalie Breen Shellie Ross Tracie Klein

N/A	∩ti	
M	OTI	On

That Landmark Commission will table this case until the August Meeting.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	7/1				
		Ayes:	-	7	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	1	Offutt
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade,
					Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# **OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS**

# Motion

Approval of Minutes - May 2, 2022

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Velvin				
Results:	8/0				
		Ayes:	-	8	Anderson, Cummings, Montgomery, Offutt, Rothenberger, Sherman, Swann, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	6	Guest, Hinojosa, Livingston, Renaud, Slade, Spellicy
		Vacancies:	-	2	Districts 3 and 11

# <u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

Hearing was adjourned at 6:16p.m.		
Evelyn Montgomery, Vice Chair	Date	