

June 3, 2019



CITY OF DALLAS
LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on June 3, 2019 with a briefing at 11:08 p.m. in room 5ES, the public hearing at 1:13 p.m. in the Council Chambers in room 5ES of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

* Alternates

Michael Amonett
*Sam Childers
Krista De La Harpe
Katherine Haskell
Rosemary Hinojosa
Evelyn Montgomery

Leigh Richter
Katherine Seale
*Diane Sherman
Katy Slade
Courtney Spellicy
Renee Strickland

Robert Swann
Emily Williams

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: **No one**

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: **No one**

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:

Donald Payton
Courtney Peach

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:

Donald Payton
Courtney Peach

The following Positions are vacant: District 11

The following Staff was present:

Jennifer Anderson
Liz Casso
Neva Dean
Mark Doty
Elaine Hill

Anna Lamberti Holmes
Melissa Parent
Marsha Prior

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

Briefings:

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

Motion was made to approve Consent Items C 1 – C13, following staff recommendations. C7 was moved to discussion.

Maker:	Strickland				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Slade, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Peach
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

Motion was made to take Item C-7, D1, D2, D4, D7 and the remaining items will be heard in their natural order.

Maker:	Strickland				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Slade, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Peach
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

CONSENT ITEMS

1. 1309 MAIN ST

Republic National Bank (Davis) Building
CA189-506(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Install flat metal canopy on south elevation – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i)
2. Remove existing lighting from south elevation and install planters with new lighting – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.3 for outdoor lighting, Section 3.4 for landscaping, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. 508 PARK AVE

Harwood Historic District
CA189-507(LC)
Liz Casso

1. Improvements to site including new hardscaping and curb ramp, new landscaping, new fencing and retaining wall modifications, installation of storage containers and dumpster, and a painted steel kiosk – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.4 for landscaping and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Install new storefront windows and doors on west elevation – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 for fenestration and openings and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install two new door openings and two new window openings on south elevation – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2 for fenestration and openings and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install new doors in existing openings on north and east elevations – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2(a) for fenestration and openings and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
5. Install new gate and egress ladder on east elevation. – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Install new skylights over original skylight openings. – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
7. Install LED-up light on roof beneath painted sign. – Approve – Approve specifications dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.4 for landscaping and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
8. Construct a vertical addition, including the installation of solar panels on the addition's roof – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding that while the proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3.3(b) which states that no vertical extensions are permitted on the roof, it meets the criteria in Section 41A-4.501(g)(6)(B) for Landmark Commission

approval of work that does not strictly comply because the proposed work is historically accurate, is consistent with the spirit and intent of the preservation criteria and will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or the integrity of the historic overlay district.

3. 5115 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District
CA189-504(MLP)
Melissa Parent

Construct accessory structure in rear yard – Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory buildings in the preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(A) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

4. 4513 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA189-514(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Remove two rear non-historic additions and replace with new rear addition – Approve – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for new construction and additions in the preservation criteria Sections 4.2 and 4.3, and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Replace brick with wood siding on front and side elevations – Approve with conditions – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the condition that new wood siding matches original in material, profile, and dimension with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.6 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Install free-standing directional sign in front yard – Approve – Approve site plan and sign illustration dated 6/3/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 7.2 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
4. Install landscaping – Approve – Approve landscape plan dated 6/3/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.6 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

5. 4512 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District
CA189-509(MP)
Marsha Prior

1. Construct addition to rear elevation – Approve with conditions – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the condition that French doors are wood, 15-lite as shown in drawing, roof shingles match existing in style and color, porch floor is wood, and that a vertical trim board is placed on left side elevation to separate existing main structure from new addition with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, and 4.7, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

2. Construct covered porch on rear elevation – Approve with conditions – Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with condition that rear porch posts include simple base and cap as shown on drawings with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.2 and 4.3, and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

6. 4523 SYCAMORE ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District

CA189-513(MP)

Marsha Prior

1. Replace front door with wood door – Approve – Approve door specifications dated 6/3/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Remove two posts and replace three posts on front porch – Approve with conditions – Approve illustration dated 6/3/19 with the condition that the current column third from left, is relocated to the end of the front entry gable with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.20 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

7. 5707 SWISS AVE (Moved Discussion)

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA189-518(MLP)

Melissa Parent

1. Remove second-story rear overhang on rear accessory structure.
2. Extend front facade of rear accessory structure by 2'-0". Infill with siding and roofing to match existing.
3. Enclose stairway on side facade of rear accessory structure.
4. Remove eight window openings and install eleven new window openings with wood windows in new locations.

Speakers:	For:	D'Jelma Perkinson
	Against:	No One

Motion

1. Remove second-story rear overhang on rear accessory structure. Approve - Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory structures in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(A)(ii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
2. Extend front facade of rear accessory structure by 2'-0". Infill with siding and roofing to match existing. – Approve - Approve drawings and specifications dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory structures in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(A)(ii) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
3. Enclose stairway on side facade of rear accessory structure - Approve drawings dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory structures in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(A)(ii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

4. Remove eight window openings and install eleven new window openings with wood windows in new locations - Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for accessory structures in the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(A)(ii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Williams				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Slade, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	2	Payton, Peach
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. 700 N MARSALIS AVE

Lake Cliff Historic District
CA189-500(MLP)
Melissa Parent

1. Replace 60% of wood siding with new wood siding on main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. Install new wood column wraps on front facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
3. Remove two door openings on corner side facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
4. Remove one door opening on rear facade with new French door. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
5. Replace one door on rear facade with new French door. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
6. Replace nine windows with new vinyl windows. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
7. Remove two window openings on corner side facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
8. Modify size of two existing window openings and install new vinyl windows on rear facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
9. Replace roof with new shingles.
10. Paint front porch masonry to match body color of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.
11. Paint retaining wall and front stairway cheek walls "White." Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

5. Replace one door on rear facade with new French door. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve - Approve photos dated 6/3/19 with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
6. Replace nine windows with new vinyl windows. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Denial without Prejudice - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 5.3 that states "Replacement doors and windows must express muntin and mullion size, light configuration, and material to match historic."
7. Remove two window openings on corner side facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Denial without Prejudice - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the completed work inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 4.1(c) that states "Historic solid-to-void ratios of protected facades must be maintained.
8. Modify size of two existing window openings and install new vinyl windows on rear facade. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness. - Denial without Prejudice - The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 4.5 that states "Historic materials must be repaired if possible; they may be replaced only when necessary."
9. Replace roof with new shingles - Approve - Approve specifications dated 6/3/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with the criteria for roofs in the preservation criteria Section 6.2 and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
10. Paint front porch masonry to match body color of main structure. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve - Approve with the finding the initiated work is consistent with the criteria for in the preservation criteria Section 4.1(e) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
11. Paint retaining wall and front stairway cheek walls "White." Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness – Deny without prejudice with a finding of fact that the work would adversely affect a character defining feature of the Lake Cliff Historical District.
12. Replace existing fence in rear and side yard. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve - Approve with the finding the completed work is consistent with the criteria for building site and landscaping in the preservation criteria Section 3.11(d) and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
13. Remove eight trees. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve with the finding the completed work is consistent with the criteria for building site and landscaping in the preservation criteria Section 3.7 and it meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
14. Remove white picket fence in front yard. Work completed without Certificate of Appropriateness - Approve - Approve with the finding the completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Williams				
Results:	13/0				

					Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

3. 4918 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA189-497(MLP)

Melissa Parent

Install new Storm Master asphalt shingles in "Blackstone Slate."

Speakers:

For: No one

Against: No one

Motion

Install new Storm Master asphalt shingles in "Blackstone Slate" - Denial without Prejudice – The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(N)(ii) that states roof materials and colors must compliment the style and overall color scheme of the building structure.

Maker:	Strickland				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

4. 509 MAIN ST

West End Historic District

CA189-502(LC)

Liz Casso

Install white spandrel glazing on various windows on Criminal Courts and Annex Buildings.

Speakers:

For: Felicia Santiago

window with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.2 and 5.3 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

3. Infill four windows on side elevations. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Deny without prejudice – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 5.1 which states that historic windows must remain intact.
4. Install wood front door – Deny without prejudice – The proposed door does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 5.3 which states that replacement doors must express profile, muntin and mullion size, light configuration, and material to match historic.
5. Paint brick columns. Brand: Behr, SC-112 'Barn Red.' Work initiated without a Certificate of Appropriateness – Deny without prejudice – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(e) which states that brick elements on protected facades may not be painted.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Strickland				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

6. 307 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA189-503(MLP)
Melissa Parent

Paint front concrete porch floor on main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Color: SW2739 "Charcoal Blue."

Speakers: For: No one

Against: No one

Motion

Paint front concrete porch floor on main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Color: SW2739 "Charcoal Blue." - Denial without Prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P

87.111(a)(11)(A) that states “railings, moldings, tilework, carvings, and other detailing and architectural decorations on front porch entrances and porches must be typical of the style and period of the main building;” and the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) that states “The colors of a structure must be complimentary of each other.”

Maker:	Strickland				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

7. 206 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District

CA189-516(MLP)

Melissa Parent

Construct new accessory structure in rear yard.

Speakers: For: Richard Fitzgerald

Against: No one

Motion

Construct new accessory structure in rear yard – Denial without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because the Applicant did not meet the burden of proof to justify the work.

Maker:	Childers				
Second:	De La Harpe				
Results:	8/5				
		Ayes:	-	8	Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	5	Amonett, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

8. 200 N WINDOMERE AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA189-499(MLP)
Melissa Parent
Install new 8'-0" wood fence in rear corner side yard.

Speakers: For: No one
Against: No one

Motion

Install new 8'-0" wood fence in rear corner side yard – Deny without prejudice - The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with the preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(2)(B) that states “Maximum permitted height for a fence is nine feet.”

Maker:	Childers				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

9. 102 N WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District
CA189-515(MLP)
Melissa Parent
Construct new rear addition on main structure.

Speakers: For: Richard Fitzgerald
Against: No One

Motion

Construct new rear addition on main structure – Approve - Approve with a finding of fact that the brick will be joined together with an expansion joint and the roof valley will have a membrane pan covered by shingles that matches the shingle color.

OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS

Motion

Approval of May 6th Minutes

Maker:	Strickland				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	13/0				
		Ayes:	-	13	Amonett, Childers, De La Harpe, Haskel, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Strickland, Swann, Williams, Spellicy, Sherman,
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	3	Payton, Peach, Slade
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 11

ADJOURNMENT

Hearing was adjourned at 4:00 P.M.

Katherine Seale, Chair

Date