

The Dallas Landmark Commission held a meeting on February 4, 2019 with a briefing at 12:09 p.m. in room 5ES, the public hearing at 1:18 p.m. in the Council Chambers of City Hall.

The following Commissioners were present for the meeting:

\* Alternates

\*John Allender Evelyn Montgomery Robert Swann
Michael Amonett Courtney Peach Renee Strickland
Krista De La Harpe Leigh Richter Courtney Spellicy
Mattia James Flabiano, Vice Chair
Rosemary Hinojosa \*Diane Sherman Emily Williams

The following ex-officio member was present for the meeting: No one

The following ex-officio member was absent for the meeting: No one

The following Commissioners were absent from the Meeting:

**Donald Payton** 

The following Commissioners were absent from the briefing:

**Donald Payton** 

The following Positions are vacant: District 3

The following Staff was present:

Liz Casso Melissa Parent Neva Dean Marsha Prior

Mark Doty Anna Lamberti Holmes

Elaine Hill Kris Sweckard

Staff briefed the Landmark Commission on each agenda item and a question and answer period followed each briefing.

A variety of dockets, requests and briefings were presented to the Commission during the open public hearing. The applicants or their representatives presented their arguments, citizen comments were heard, and using information and staff recommendations in the hearing dockets, the Commission took the following actions.

## **Briefings:**

The Commissioners were briefed on the consent and individual discussion items.

## Motion was made to move Consent Item C4 to the discussion agenda.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Williams				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

# Motion was made to approve Consent Items C1, C2, C3 and C5 following staff recommendations.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Allender				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

Motion was made to rearrange the agenda and take C4, D1, D2, D5 and the remaining items will be heard in their natural order.

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

# **CONSENT ITEMS**

#### 1. 1910 PACIFIC ST

Harwood Historic District CA189-210(LC)

Liz Casso

- Replace brick pavers with grey tile on north and south patios. Approve Approve drawings dated 2/4/2019 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install exterior lighting on north and south patios. Approve Approve drawings dated 2/4/2019 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.4 for landscaping and lighting in Tracts A & C and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 3. Construct two shade structures on north patio. Approve Approve drawings dated 2/4/2019 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(ii).
- 4. Reconstruct existing brick planters on north patio. Approve with conditions Approve drawings dated 2/4/2019 with the condition that the planters be clad in salvaged brick from the original planters, with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

#### 2. **4525 SYCAMORE ST**

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CD189-005(MLP) Melissa Parent

Demolish rear accessory structure using standard "Imminent threat to public health/safety". – Approve The proposed demolition meets all of the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(C). The structure constitutes a documented major and imminent threat to public health and safety; the demolition or removal is required to alleviate the threat to public health and safety; and there is no

reasonable way, other than demolition or removal, to eliminate the threat in a timely manner.

#### 3. 5521 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA189-213(MLP) Melissa Parent

- 1. Install one security camera on side facade. Work completed without CA. Approve The completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Install electric car charger dock on side facade. Work completed without CA. Approve The completed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

## 4. 2826 METROPOLITAN AVE (Moved to Discussion)

Wheatley Place Historic District CA189-216(MP) Marsha Prior

Speakers For: Zack Bigelow Against: No one

Motion #1

Construct single family house – Approve – Approve drawings and specifications dated 2/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 9.2, 9.3, 9.7, 9.8, 9.9, and 9.11 and meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker:	Williams				
Second:	Sherman				MOTION FAILED
Results:	5/10				
		Ayes:	-	5	Amonett, Hinojosa, Peach, Spellicy, Williams
		Against:	-	10	*Allender, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Strickland, Swann
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

#### Motion #2

Construct single family house – Deny – Deny without prejudice because of a lack of porch.

Maker:	Montgomery				
Second:	Peach				
Results:	13/2				
		Ayes:	-	13	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman,

			Slade, Spellicy, Strickland, Williams
Against:	-	2	Hinojosa, Swann
Absent:	-	1	Payton
Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

#### 5. 218 N WINNETKA AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA189-217(MP) Marsha Prior

Replace secondary front door with Craftsman style wood door. – Approve – Approve door image dated 2/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

# **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### 1. 4706 JUNIUS ST

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA189-212(MLP)

Melissa Parent

- 1. Install new concrete driveway.
- 2. Install new wood decking on front porch and stain.
- 3. Install new wood front porch skirting to match existing siding on main structure.
- 4. Install 6'-0" wood fence and gates in rear and side yards.

Speakers: For: Jordan Heringer

Jeff Rogney

Against: No one

#### Motion

- 1. Install new concrete driveway. Approve Approve site plan dated 2/4/2019 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 2. Install new wood decking on front porch and stain Approve Approve the applicant's request and the details as submitted on 2/4/19, as the requested wood porch is compatible with the historic overlay district.
- 3. Install new wood front porch skirting to match existing siding on main structure Approve Approve the applicant's request and the details as submitted on 2/4/19, as the requested wood porch is compatible with the historic overlay district.
- 4. Install 6'-0" wood fence and gates in rear and side yards. Approve Approve site plan and images dated 2/4/2019 with the finding the proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker:	Flabiano		
Second:	Williams		

Results:	14/1				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	1	Sherman
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

#### 2. 509 MAIN ST

West End Historic District CA189-209(LC) Liz Casso Install green tinted glass on additions.

#### **Motion**

Install green tinted glass on additions. – Approve – Approve images dated 2/4/19 with the finding the proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.2 for façade materials and meets the standards in City code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).

Speakers: For: Paul Manno Jeff Blackwell

Against: No One

Maker:	Williams				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	-	14	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	1	Peach
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

<sup>\*</sup> Commissioner Allender recused himself and did not hear or vote on this case

### 3. 3712 S MALCOLM X BLVD

Wheatley Place Historic District CA189-215(MP)

Marsha Prior

- 1. Install double door on side elevation.
- 2. Replace vinyl siding with new vinyl siding.
- 3. Replace cornice on all elevations.

Speakers: For: Dalia Sanchez

Against: No one

#### Motion

Install double door on side elevation. – Approve – Approve a single door on the side elevation
which is in the rear 50% of the house and sighting security issues, approve a multiple panel metal
door.

- 2. Replace vinyl siding with new vinyl siding Approve Approve with the condition that the front facade siding be wood 117, revising existing material or saving new 117 wood siding to replace termite damaged wood. 117 wood siding to continue both sides to the same dimension from the front on both sides to the hip roof and before the two-story addition. Vinyl siding is approved for sides and rear that matches 117siding in profile with a vertical wood batten board between wood & vinyl.
- 3. Replace cornice on all elevations. Approve Approve with conditions proposed work with the condition that cornice material is wood with the finding the work meets the standard in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Amonett				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

#### 4. 3735 HAVANA ST

Wheatley Place Historic District CA189-214(MP)

Marsha Prior

- 1. Remove brick chimney on front elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Replace all aluminum windows with new aluminum windows and add wood trim. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 3. Replace front door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 4. Remove vents and install vertical paneling on front porch gable. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 5. Install vertical paneling on front elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 6. Install fan light in front dormer. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 7. Install front yard wrought iron fence and paint Brown. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Speakers:	For:	No one

Against: No one

#### **Motion**

 Remove brick chimney on front elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. – Deny without prejudice – The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(a) which states that front facades of contributing structures are protected.

- 2. Replace all aluminum windows with new aluminum windows and add wood trim. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny without prejudice The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 5.3 which states that replacement windows must express profile, muntin and mullion size, light configuration, and material to match the historic.
- 3. Replace front door. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Approve Approve completed work with the finding the door is consistent with preservation criteria Section 5.3 and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 4. Remove vents and install vertical paneling on front porch gable. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny without prejudice The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(a) which states that front facades of contributing structures are protected.
- 5. Install vertical paneling on front elevation. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny without prejudice The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.3 which states that wood siding, trim, and detailing must be restored whenever practical.
- 6. Install fan light in front dormer. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny without prejudice The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(a) which states that front facades of contributing structures are protected.
- 7. Install front yard wrought iron fence and paint Brown. Work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Deny without prejudice The completed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) because it is inconsistent with preservation criteria Section 3.11(a) which states that fences in the front yard may not exceed 3'-6".

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	12/3				
		Ayes:	-	12	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Montgomery, Richter, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	3	Hinojosa, Peach, Seale
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

#### 5. 127 N EDGEFIELD AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA189-218(MP)

Marsha Prior

- 1. Construct rear addition.
- 2. Replace aluminum windows with wood windows.
- 3. Replace front door.
- 4. Remove aluminum siding and replace existing wood siding, up to 50% as needed.
- 5. Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body SW 6163 "Grassland;" Trim SW 7636 "Origami White;" Accent SW 2846 "Roycroft Bronze Green."

Speakers: For: Carl Sanford Isaac Martinez

isaac Martine.

Against: No one

#### Motion

- 1. Construct rear addition. Approve Approve drawings dated 2/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(2) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 2. Replace aluminum windows with wood windows Approve Approve with condition that the windows are all wood w-2500 Jeld Wen windows, not clad.
- 3. Replace front door. Approve Approve specifications dated 2/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(17)(F)(iii) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii).
- 4. Remove aluminum siding and replace existing wood siding, up to 50% as needed. Approve with conditions Approve proposed work with the condition that rear addition has concrete skirting, that existing brick skirting remains, and that concrete and brick are painted to match the wood siding with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(10)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i).
- 5. Paint main structure. Brand: Sherwin Williams. Body SW 6163 "Grassland;" Trim SW 7636 "Origami White;" Accent SW 2846 "Roycroft Bronze Green." Approve Approve paint specifications dated 2/4/19 with the finding the work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(a)(8)(B) and 51P-87.111(a)(8)(C) and meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(q)(6)(C)(i).

Maker:	Allender				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

# **OTHER BUSINESS ITEMS**

# Motion

Approval of January Minutes

Maker:	Flabiano				
Second:	Williams				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	*Allender, Amonett, De La Harpe, Flabiano, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Peach, Richter, Seale, Sherman, Slade, Spellicy, Strickland Swann, Williams
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Payton
		Vacancies:	-	1	Dist. 3

# **ADJOURNMENT**

Hearing was adjourned at 3:50 P.M.		
Katherine Seale, Chair	 Date	