

Memorandum



CITY OF DALLAS

DATE February 1, 2019

TO Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

SUBJECT **Options for *The Confederate Monument***

On Wednesday, February 6, 2019, you will be briefed on the Options for *The Confederate Monument*. The briefing materials are attached for your review. As noted in the presentation materials, the options, steps and timelines are as follows:

- OPTION 1: Re-envision the monument and site
 - OCA will contract with the artist and brief the proposal to City Council within 120 days
 - Upon approval by Council, staff will seek review from the Public Art Committee and the Arts and Culture Advisory Commission
 - Staff will file a certificate of appropriateness (CA) with the Landmark Commission and include the Arts and Culture Advisory Commission recommendation
 - Landmark Commission will hear the certificate application within 30 days and has 65 days to approve/deny the application
 - Only the applicant/city may appeal CA denial by the Landmark Commission within 30 days after the decision
 - City Plan Commission has no timeline to hear and decide an appeal
 - Future budget considerations
 - The cost and funding sources to make alterations to the monument and site are unknown at this time but will be determined through the proposal and public art process, and may require procurement
- OPTION 2: Remove the monument
 - Pending a record vote on an upcoming agenda to exhaust all options to remove the monument, staff will file a certificate for demolition or removal (CD) and Landmark Commission will hear the certification
 - Of five potential standards for CD, the only appropriate standard is “Noncontributing to the historic overlay district because it is newer than the period of significance”
 - City Manager’s Office and OCA staff would present the case to Landmark Commission
 - Landmark Commission has 65 days to approve/deny the application
 - Any interested person may appeal a decision of the Landmark Commission within 30 days after their decision
 - If requested to “exhaust all options” for removal, staff would automatically appeal a Landmark Commission denial to the City Plan Commission (CPC), which must decide the appeal within 65 days after the appeal is filed
 - On appeal, CPC would not hear any new evidence and only decide whether the Landmark Commission erred in its decision
 - Estimated removal and storage cost is ~\$480,000
 - Future budget considerations
 - The final cost and funding sources to remove the monument are unknown at this time and may require procurement and City Council authorization
 - Note: Both Landmark Commission and CPC would be functioning as quasi-judicial bodies and therefore City Council members shall not speak to members of either board about the case once it is filed
- OPTION 3: Take no further action

Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions or concerns.



Joey Zapata
Assistant City Manager

c: T.C. Broadnax, City Manager
Chris Caso, City Attorney (I)
Carol Smith, City Auditor (I)
Biliera Johnson, City Secretary
Preston Robinson, Administrative Judge
Kimberly Bizer Tolbert, Chief of Staff to the City Manager

Majed A. Al-Ghafry, Assistant City Manager
Jon Fortune, Assistant City Manager
Nadia Chandler Hardy, Assistant City Manager and Chief Resilience Officer
M. Elizabeth Reich, Chief Financial Officer
Laila Aleqresh, Chief Innovation Officer
Directors and Assistant Directors

Options for *The Confederate Monument*

Briefing to City Council
February 6, 2019

Jennifer Scripps, Director
Kay Kallos, Public Art Program Manager
Office of Cultural Affairs



City of Dallas

Presentation Overview

- Purpose
- Background
- Related Projects and Approaches
- New Option: Re-envision the monument and site
- Options and Timelines
- Next Steps
- Appendix



Purpose

- Review and discuss options for *The Confederate Monument* and Pioneer Cemetery, including a new option requested by City Council to make enhancements and improvements to the site
 - Contract with artist Lauren Woods for a proposal to re-envision the monument and site

Background: Monument and Site

- *The Confederate Monument*
 - Designed by Frank Teich in 1896 and erected in 1897
 - Consists of five Confederate statues: three generals (Lee, Jackson, Johnston) and CSA president (Davis) and a Confederate soldier at center
 - Base inscribed with tributes to Confederate seamen, infantry, cavalry, and Southern women
 - Relocated to Pioneer Cemetery from Old City Park in 1961 due to highway construction
- Pioneer Cemetery
 - Pioneer Cemetery site was on the southern edge of Dallas when the first burial occurred in 1840's
 - The last body was interred in 1921
 - Originally comprised of four separate and historic cemeteries: Masonic, Odd Fellows, Jewish, and the City cemetery
 - Designated a Dallas Landmark in May 2002 (Historic overlay No. 114)



Background: Prior Actions

- October 23, 2017: City Council Briefing
 - Mayor's Task Force on Confederate Monuments recommended removal and either a long-term loan or donation to an institution in North Texas or storage for future disposition (see Appendix)
- March 21, 2018: City Council Briefing
 - Staff recommended an alternative approach to add historical context and information
 - Otherwise, removal and storage of the monument
- April 25, 2018: City Council Resolution Adopted
 - City Council directed the City Manager to present options to enhance and improve Pioneer Cemetery, such as new statues, plaques and alterations to the monument
 - City Manager committed to provide options by Fall 2018
 - By memorandum on October 15, 2018, Councilman Atkins, Councilman Felder and Mayor Pro Tem Thomas requested that consideration be scheduled after a District 4 Council Member was seated

Related Projects and Approaches

- The Office of Cultural Affairs (OCA) has researched projects in other cities and artistic examinations of the Civil War to help inform the new option for the site
 - Renaming of Existing Monument
 - *Confederate Memorial*, Forsyth Park, Savannah, GA (See Appendix)
 - Artistic Examination – New Art Pertaining to Civil War Themes
 - Kara Walker, *Harper's Pictorial History of the Civil War*, 2017. Smithsonian American Art Museum (See Appendix)
 - Mark Bradford, *Pickett's Charge*, 2017-2021. Hirshhorn Museum and Sculpture Garden (See Appendix)
 - Other cities' approaches are listed on the next page

Related Projects and Approaches

<p>Removed and stored out of public view¹:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New Orleans, LA • Baltimore, MD 	<p>Renamed/amended signage¹:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Memphis, TN • Savannah, GA (in process)
<p>Removed and relocated to publicly accessible site¹:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tampa, FL – cemetery • Lexington, KY – cemetery • Gainesville, FL - cemetery 	<p>Monuments sold to private entity¹:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Memphis, TN
<p>Locations where protesters have destroyed or damaged Confederate monuments¹:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Durham, NC • Chapel Hill, NC • Sylvania, GA 	<p>Contextualization²:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Richmond, VA (in process)
<p>Sources: ¹ Southern Poverty Law Center Report, July 2018 ² Richmond Magazine, January 24, 2019</p>	<p>No city has chosen to demolish a Confederate Monument¹</p>

New Option: Re-envision the Monument and Site

- Scope

- Contract with artist Lauren Woods to engage the public through a creative process to develop a proposal to re-envision the monument and site
 - Creation of a Think Tank – a study group – to research and define the history and current context of The Confederate Monument, and subsequent public input
 - The artist's proposal would be presented to City Council within 120 days
 - Upon approval by City Council, the proposal would follow the established City of Dallas public art process
 - Present a concept design to the Public Art Committee for review and recommendation to the Arts and Culture Advisory Committee
 - File for a certificate of appropriateness (CA) at the Landmark Commission

New Option: Re-envision the Monument and Site

- About the artist, lauren woods
 - Conceptual artist whose multi-media projects engage history as a lens by which to view the socio-politics of the present
 - Visiting Lecturer at SMU Meadows School of the Arts
 - woods' work has been exhibited throughout the US and internationally
 - Numerous grants and awards include: The Creative Capital Foundation, The Tribeca Film Institute, College Art Association, Alliance of Artists Communities and The San Francisco Foundation
 - See Appendix for more information about lauren woods' work
 - *Drinking Fountain #1*
 - Unveiled in 2013, woods' new media monument is at the site of rediscovered remnants of Jim Crow, faint traces of a segregation-era "Whites Only" sign at the Dallas County Records Building and is recognized as work relevant to Confederate Monuments in Dallas
 - *American Monument*
 - Launched in 2018, woods' exhibit is a nomadic, networked, new media monument, designed to be a tool, with research, educational and activist functions, the MONUMENT inhabits space to present the relationship between constructed race, material violence, and structural power

New Option: Re-envision the Monument and Site



Drinking Fountain #1



American Monument

Summary of Options and Timelines

- **OPTION 1: Re-envision the monument and site**
 - Contract with lauren woods for a proposal to re-envision the monument and site
 - Brief proposal to City Council within 120 days
 - Estimated cost is ~\$10,000 through concept proposal, with additional future budget considerations
- **OPTION 2: Remove the monument**
 - Schedule a record vote on an upcoming City Council agenda to exhaust all options to remove the monument
 - File a certificate for demolition or removal (CD) as a non-contributing structure in the Pioneer Cemetery landmark and Landmark Commission will hear the certification
 - Estimated removal and storage cost is ~\$480,000
- **OPTION 3: Take no further action**

Options and Timelines

- **OPTION 1: Re-envision the monument and site**
 - OCA will contract with the artist and brief the proposal to City Council within 120 days
 - Upon approval by Council, staff will seek review from the Public Art Committee and the Arts and Culture Advisory Commission
 - Staff will file a certificate of appropriateness (CA) with the Landmark Commission and include the Arts and Culture Advisory Commission recommendation
 - Landmark Commission will hear the certificate application within 30 days and has 65 days to approve/deny the application
 - Only the applicant/city may appeal CA denial by the Landmark Commission within 30 days after the decision
 - City Plan Commission has no timeline to hear and decide an appeal
 - Future budget considerations
 - The cost and funding sources to make alterations to the monument and site are unknown at this time but will be determined through the proposal and public art process, and may require procurement

Options and Timelines

- **OPTION 2: Remove the monument**
 - Pending a record vote on an upcoming agenda to exhaust all options to remove the monument, staff will file a certificate for demolition or removal (CD) and Landmark Commission will hear the certification
 - Of five potential standards for CD, the only appropriate standard is “Noncontributing to the historic overlay district because it is newer than the period of significance”
 - City Manager’s Office and OCA staff would present the case to Landmark Commission
 - Landmark Commission has 65 days to approve/deny the application
 - Any interested person may appeal a decision of the Landmark Commission within 30 days after their decision
 - If requested to “exhaust all options” for removal, staff would automatically appeal a Landmark Commission denial to the City Plan Commission (CPC), which must decide the appeal within 65 days after the appeal is filed
 - On appeal, CPC would not hear any new evidence and only decide whether the Landmark Commission erred in its decision
 - Estimated removal and storage cost is ~\$480,000
 - Future budget considerations
 - The final cost and funding sources to remove the monument are unknown at this time and may require procurement and City Council authorization
 - **Note: Both Landmark Commission and CPC would be functioning as quasi-judicial bodies and therefore City Council members shall not speak to members of either board about the case once it is filed**

Options and Timelines

- OPTION 3: Take no further action

Next Steps

- City Council discussion
 - OPTION 1: Re-envision the monument and site
 - OPTION 2: Remove and store the monument
 - OPTION 3: Take no further action

Options for *The Confederate Monument*

Briefing to City Council
February 6, 2019

Jennifer Scripps, Director
Kay Kallos, Public Art Program Manager
Office of Cultural Affairs



City of Dallas

Appendix: Task Force Recommendation

- On September 29, 2017, the final report from the Mayor's Task Force on Confederate Monuments recommended:
 - that the City of Dallas seek to place the Confederate Monument on long-term loan or donation to a museum, educational institution, or educational site located within North Texas so that they may be preserved and used for educational purposes through display within the full historical context of the City War, Reconstruction, 'Lost Cause' mythology, and the 'Jim Crow' era. If the City is unsuccessful in its efforts and the statues remain in storage after three years, the City Council should revisit this issue.



Appendix: Related Projects

- Renaming of an existing monument
 - The *Confederate Memorial* has stood at the center of Forsyth Park in Savannah since 1875 in memory of slain Confederate soldiers



Appendix: Related Projects

- Savannah Mayor Eddie DeLoach convened a task force “to expand the story this monument tells to be inclusive of all”
- Changes recommended
 - To be renamed the Civil War Memorial, with a new plaque added on one side that reads: **“This memorial was originally erected in 1875 to the Confederate dead, redesigned in 1879, and rededicated in 2018 to all the dead of the American Civil War”**
 - The Confederate soldier statue on top will remain, but busts of two Confederate officers standing beside the monument will be moved to a local cemetery



Appendix: Related Projects

- Artistic examinations and new art pertaining to themes of Confederate Monuments and Civil War History
 - Kara Walker
 - Mark Bradford



Appendix: Related Projects

- Kara Walker
 - Became the youngest recipient of the MacArthur Fellowship (the “Genius Grant”) in 1997
 - Known for exploring the intersection of race, gender, and sexuality through her iconic, silhouetted figures
 - In an exhibition at the Smithsonian Museum of American Art in 2017, she explored the myths of slavery and the Civil War through the depiction of characters based on racist caricatures once widely disseminated throughout popular 19th-century culture



Harper's Ferry Pictorial History of the Civil War, 2017 by Kara Walker



Appendix: Related Projects

- Mark Bradford
 - Mark Bradford's Pickett's Charge, a monumental new commission by the Hirshhorn Museum that re-contextualized the Gettysburg Cyclorama was unveiled in 2017
 - Based on the Gettysburg Cyclorama (1883), a large Confederate painting by Paul Philippoteaux that is longer than a football field and taller than a four-story structure and on display at Gettysburg National Military Park
 - Pickett's Charge debuted November 2017 and is on view through 2021
 - Bradford invites visitors to reconsider how narratives about American history are shaped and contested and poses questions about the presentation and representation of American history that are particularly timely in contemporary America



Appendix: Related Projects

- Mark Bradford
 - “Politically and socially, we are at the edge of another precipice. As an artist I’m standing in the middle of a question about where we are as a nation.”
 - Los Angeles–based artist whose work addresses socio-political issues such as race, class, and gender, while also engaging art history
 - Awarded the MacArthur Genius Grant in 2009, and in 2016, the US Department of State’s National Medal of Arts



Appendix: lauren woods

- Lead collaborator for Reading Monuments, an emerging coalition of think tanks in southern cities that are examining the legacy and future of confederate monuments
 - DFW- based organizer in partnership with FW Modern
- Facilitated community-driven think tank workshops in response to urgent political realities
- In 2015, she led a workshop entitled, Sustaining Cultural Heritage in a Changing Landscape, as a part of the NEA and California Arts Council funded initiative, Antelope Valley Art Outpost Project, a creative placemaking effort that supported regional vitality through artist-driven projects
 - The project connected diverse local LA County community members with public-practice artists working in socio-political spheres in order to help develop non-traditional methods of addressing political concerns

