

Memorandum



CITY OF DALLAS

DATE March 16, 2018

TO Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

SUBJECT **Confederate Monuments Recommendations and Next Steps**

On Wednesday, March 21, 2018, you will be briefed on the Confederate Monuments Recommendations and Next Steps. The briefing materials are attached for your review.

Please feel free to contact me if you have any questions or concerns.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Joey Zapata".

Joey Zapata

Assistant City Manager

c: T.C. Broadnax, City Manager
Larry Casto, City Attorney
Craig D. Kinton, City Auditor
Biliera Johnson, City Secretary (Interim)
Daniel F. Solis, Administrative Judge
Kimberly Bizer Tolbert, Chief of Staff to the City Manager
Majed A. Al-Ghafry, Assistant City Manager

Jo M. (Jody) Puckett, Assistant City Manager (Interim)
Jon Fortune, Assistant City Manager
M. Elizabeth Reich, Chief Financial Officer
Nadia Chandler Hardy, Chief of Community Services
Raquel Favela, Chief of Economic Development & Neighborhood Services
Theresa O'Donnell, Chief of Resilience
Directors and Assistant Directors

Confederate Monuments Recommendations and Next Steps

**City Council Briefing
March 21, 2018**

**Jennifer Scripps, Director
Office of Cultural Affairs
City of Dallas**



Presentation Outline

- Background
- Purpose
- Task Force Recommendations
- Implementation Options & Alternatives, with Impacts
- Proposed Action
- Next Steps



Background

- The Mayor's Task Force on Confederate Monuments was created in August 2017 to make recommendations on the following:
 - *Robert E. Lee and the Confederate Soldier (the "Lee")*
 - *The Confederate Monument*
 - Fair Park Art
 - Streets with Confederate Names
 - Places with Confederate Names
 - Robert E. Lee Park
 - Confederate Cemetery

Background

- On September 6, 2017, City Council voted to immediately remove the Lee and place it in storage, pending Task Force recommendations
- The Confederate Monuments Task Force met from August 18 to September 22, 2017
 - All Task Force materials (agendas, briefings, videos, meeting minutes) are available on www.dallasculture.org/confederatemonuments
- City Council was briefed on October 23, 2017
 - Staff committed to prepare implementation options by March 2018

Purpose

- Review implementation options based on recommendations made by the Mayor's Task Force on Confederate Monuments and staff recommendations



Task Force Recommendations

- 1a/1b: Place both monuments with a North Texas institution for preservation, education and full historical context
- 2: Maintain artistic pieces in place at Fair Park, using various media to promote full historical context
- 3: Add commemoration of the Hall of Negro Life at Fair Park
- 4: Return/recreate the Hall of Negro Life murals at Fair Park
- 5: Remove the Robert E. Lee Park name
- 6: Remove the Confederate Cemetery name and request the Park Board rename it in a proper context
- 7: Use citywide engagement to consider naming City parks with placeholder names for rights leaders, the marginalized, underrepresented, and victims of police brutality

Task Force Recommendations

- 8: Rename streets named for Confederate leaders Gano, Lee and Cabell
- 9: Rename streets named for Stonewall and Beauregard
- 10: Rename streets on a priority basis (90 days) with expanded and equal weight to all Dallas residents
- 11: Use paid local/regional artists, architects, preservationists, and historians for implementation
- 12: Erect a marker at Akard and Main streets memorializing the lynching of Allen Brooks
- 13: Create a City racial equity policy after public acknowledgement and apology for the policies and practices that furthered institutional racism and segregation

7



Implementation Options/Alternatives

- 1a/1b: As recommended by the Task Force, seek to place both monuments with the Texas Civil War Museum near Fort Worth
 - 1a: *Robert E. Lee and the Confederate Soldier*
 - Display in front of the museum with new base, fencing, and contextual signage as part of a long-term loan (~\$75,000 to move and place on new foundation)
 - Remove remaining plinth and granite seating areas around former site and pursue option of selling the granite (~\$125,000 to remove base and surrounding steps)
 - 1b: *The Confederate Monument*
 - Given the height and size of the entire piece, the most practical feasible option is to remove statues from their columns and display at museum with contextual signage (~\$150,000)
 - Demolition of remaining base (~\$280,000)

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- Alternative 1a: Sell the *Lee* via a fine art auction house
 - Considerable interest in the *Lee* owing to its artistic quality and the artist's prominence
 - Appraised value of \$950,000, exclusive of the base
 - Fine art auction house commission range of 10-20% and increase assurance of a beneficial sale
 - If a reserve price were not met, the work would not sell and could still be placed on long-term loan or storage
 - Seek first right of purchase to prevent unwanted sale

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- Staff recommendation for both monuments, 1a/1b
 - 1a: Concur with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends seeking an agreement to place the *Lee* on long-term loan with full historical context at Texas Civil War Museum
 - 1b: Do not concur with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends keeping the Confederate Monument in its current site and adding full historical context (~\$25,000)
 - Staff recommendation recognizes the different generation/intent of this monument and a reluctance to dismantle and/or demolish the art piece

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- 2/3/11: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends forming a Fair Park Art Working Group and a contract with a Dallas-based consultant, as recommended, to add full historical context to Fair Park art and commemoration to Hall of Negro Life
 - Cost estimate range between \$50,000 - \$200,000 depending on scope of signage and locations, use of technology, etc.
- 4: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends seeking a partnership of local Dallas museums to borrow the Aaron Douglas mural, *Aspiration*, from the de Young Museum in San Francisco
 - Waiting list is 10+ years
 - Re-creation of murals in not recommended

11

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- 5: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - ✓ As recommended, Robert E. Lee Park was renamed to Oak Lawn Park by the Park & Recreation Board on September 22, 2017
- 6: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - ✓ As recommended, the Board also approved new naming policy on December 14, 2017, which allows for public engagement to name parks with placeholder names
- 7: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - The new naming policy allows the Board to rename the Confederate Cemetery, as recommended
 - The Park Board will undertake consideration of renaming of Confederate Cemetery by June 2018

12

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- 8: Staff does not fully concur with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends initiating a street name change for Lee Parkway, but not for Gano and Cabell
 - Gano and Cabell were both early Dallas residents who made considerable and important civic contributions
 - Lee Parkway name clearly honors Robert E. Lee, who has no other contributions to Dallas
 - Other considerations:
 - Letter from adjacent owners in opposition indicates a $\frac{3}{4}$ majority of Council would likely be required to authorize a change
 - City costs to change streets range from \$1,100 to \$4,900 per street, but does not include the costs to residents and businesses

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- 9: Staff does not concur with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends Stonewall and Beauregard street names remain unchanged
 - Per City records and archives, both are only presumed to be linked to prominent Confederate Generals
- 10: Staff does not concur with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends any street name change(s) be conducted via the existing process
 - Existing process allows for city-wide input
- 11: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - Staff recommends use of paid local/regional artists, architects, preservationists, and historians for implementation

14

Implementation Options/Alternatives

- 12: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - As recommended, staff will seek to place a Texas Historical marker to memorialize Allen Brooks and other interpretive signage downtown
 - State application period begins November 2018
 - Estimated cost for marker is \$5,000
- 13: Staff concurs with Task Force recommendation
 - As recommended, staff is developing a comprehensive City equity policy for an equitable, inclusive and welcoming Dallas through its resilience and welcoming communities projects
 - Advance equity internally and with the broader community via assessments, strategic partnerships, integration in planning and budgeting, and effective use of indicators and data
 - Ensure Dallas is a Welcoming City via certification process, partnerships, and improved access to key services

15

Proposed Action

- City Council consideration and approval of staff recommended implementation plan, as outlined on pages 8-15, and summarized on pages 17-19



Summary

- Staff concurs with Task Force recommendations for the following:
 - 1a: Place the *Lee* on loan with a local museum with added historical context
 - 2/3: Form a Fair Park Art Working Group to add full historical context to Fair Park and commemorate Hall of Negro Life
 - 4: Seek a partnership to borrow the Aaron Douglas mural, *Aspiration*
 - 11: Use paid local/regional artists, architects, preservationists, and historians for implementation of recommendations
 - 12: Place a Texas Historical Marker to memorialize Allen Brooks and other interpretive signage downtown
 - 13: Continue development of a comprehensive City equity policy for an equitable, inclusive and welcoming Dallas

Summary

- No Council action is required for the following Task Force recommendations to Park & Recreation Board:
 - 5: Remove the Robert E. Lee Park name
 - 6: Remove/rename the Confederate Cemetery
 - 7: Use citywide engagement to consider naming City parks



Summary

- For the items below, Staff does not concur with Task Force and instead recommends the following:
 - 1b: Maintain *The Confederate Monument* at its current site and add context
 - 8: Initiate a street name change for Lee Parkway, but not for Gano and Cabell
 - 9: Do not initiate a street name change for Stonewall and Beauregard street names
 - 10: Do not amend the street name change process to be completed with 90 days and adding expanded and equal weight to all Dallas residents

Next Steps

- With Council direction, staff will implement recommended steps and provide periodic reports to Quality of Life, Arts and Culture committee



Confederate Monuments Recommendations and Next Steps

**City Council Briefing
March 21, 2018**

**Jennifer Scripps, Director
Office of Cultural Affairs
City of Dallas**



Appendix



Task Force Recommendations

1a/1b. That the City of Dallas seek to place the statue of *Robert E. Lee* (1a)/*Confederate Monument* (1b) and the base of the sculpture on **long-term loan or by donation to a museum, educational institution, or educational site located within North Texas** so that it may be preserved and used for educational purposes through display within the **full historical context** of the Civil War, Reconstruction, 'Lost Cause' mythology, and the 'Jim Crow' era. If the City is unsuccessful in its efforts and the statues remain in storage after three years, the City Council should revisit this issue.



Task Force Recommendations

2. That the historic art and architecture of Fair Park which contains symbols of, or references to, the Confederate States of America or persons associated therewith, **remain in place as a piece of the history of Texas as presented at Fair Park.** Appropriate signage, markers, digital tours guides, public art, educational programming, and/or exhibitions be added as necessary to **provide the full context** of the Civil War, Reconstruction, “Lost Cause” mythology, the “Jim Crow” era, and the creation of Fair Park for the 1936 Texas Centennial. Historical context **should include reference to the many contributions of Mexicans, Tejanos, and indigenous peoples** made during the colonization of Texas, the Texas Revolution, and during and after the Mexican War leading to the 20th Century, to also include the participation or exclusion of various communities in those historic events.



Task Force Recommendations

3: The Task Force further recommends that the City of Dallas Park and Recreation Department and Landmark Commission work with the Dallas Historical Society concerning the foregoing, as well as with the African American Museum and the Public Art Committee in **adding a substantive commemoration of the Hall of Negro Life**, which was built for the 1936 Texas Centennial, recognition of the “Jim Crow” era and South Dallas bombings, and that the City of Dallas should allocate funding and seek additional private and grant funding for the accomplishment of this work.

4: The Task Force further recommends that attempts be made by the City to **return to Dallas, or recreate, the murals which previously occupied the Hall of Negro Life at Fair Park.**



Task Force Recommendations

5: The Task Force recommends **removal of the Robert E. Lee Park name.**

6: The Task Force recommends **removal of the Confederate Cemetery name** and request the Park Board rename it in a proper context.

7: The Task Force Recommends that a **citywide engagement process be initiated to consider renaming City parks** with placeholder names for abolitionists, the formerly enslaved, civil and human rights leaders, people from marginalized and underrepresented communities, and victims of police brutality.



Task Force Recommendations

8: The Task Force recommends that streets named after a Confederate leader and/or general, who made a significant contribution to the Confederacy, **specifically Gano, Lee and Cabell, be changed.**

9: The Task Force further recommends that the street names **Stonewall and Beauregard be changed.**

10: The Task Force further recommends that the renaming of these streets be **accomplished on a priority basis with 90 days and the comment process be expanded** to include the voices of people throughout the city whose ideas and testimony shall be given equal weight with those of adjacent property owners.



Task Force Recommendations

11: The Task Force recommends that **this process be directed and led by paid local** and regional artists, architects, preservationists, and historians.

12: The Task Force recommends that the **City erect a marker at Akard and Main streets memorializing the lynching of Allen Brooks.**

13: The Task Force recommends that the **City of Dallas create a racial equity policy** after public acknowledgement and apology for the policies and practices of the City that have furthered institutional racism and segregation.



Confederate Monuments Recommendations and Next Steps

**City Council Briefing
March 21, 2018**

**Jennifer Scripps, Director
Office of Cultural Affairs
City of Dallas**

